RESULTS OF THE STUDY ON Trafficking in Men for Labour Exploitation

Ukraine, the Republic of Belarus, the Republic of Moldova

Researcher: Nataliia Gusak, Head of School of Social Work, National University of “Kyiv-Mohyla Academy”

2016

This study was commissioned by the International Organization for Migration Mission (IOM) in Ukraine with financial support from the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. All the opinions, conclusions or recommendations are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of IOM
This study was commissioned to explore the situation of trafficking in human beings (THB) and the experience of men Victims of Trafficking (VoT) for labour exploitation from Ukraine, the Republic of Belarus, and the Republic of Moldova.

Due to the qualitative design of the study, results are not representative and thus reflect only the experiences of the respondents interviewed. In addition, only men who received assistance as VoT from the IOM Mission in their respective country and its partner NGOs participated in this research.

In total 153 men VoT for labour exploitation participated in interviews.

In addition, interviews were conducted with 19 professionals working in counter-trafficking within government, civic and international organizations.
KEY CHARACTERISTICS OF MEN VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING FOR LABOUR EXPLOITATION

**RESPONDENTS’ AGE**
- 18-35 years: 53%
- 36-67 years: 47%

**PLACE OF RESIDENCE**
- in villages: 19%
- in district centers: 10%
- in oblast centers: 71%

**FAMILY STATUS**
- married: 45%
- single: 30%
- widowers: 8%
- divorced: 13%

**EDUCATION**
- incomplete secondary education: 8%
- higher education: 24%
- vocational education: 56%
- were studying in higher educational institutions or had incomplete higher education: 8%
### Results of the Study

**Preconditions of Men to Become Victims of Trafficking**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local labour market problems, such as low levels of employment and widespread closure of industrial enterprises where a significant part of local population traditionally worked.</td>
<td>A significant number of respondents claimed to have had a positive experience of employment in another country, both during the time of the Soviet Union and in recent years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant differentiation of competitive wages between local and labour markets in destination country and a desire to seek higher earnings outside their country of origin.</td>
<td>A willingness to go abroad, a desire for higher earnings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growing irrelevance of many professions for the modern labour market.</td>
<td>Openness of borders (legality of migration) and knowledge of the language in the host country.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### FACTORS THAT LEAD TO JOB-SEEKING IN ANOTHER COUNTRY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Republic of Moldova</th>
<th>The Republic of Belarus</th>
<th>Ukraine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a seasonal prevalence in agriculture as a contributing factor of going abroad</td>
<td>a reduced work week in countries abroad as well as difficulties related to private entrepreneurship regulation</td>
<td>a lack of opportunities for career growth and an existing large number of specialists with non-competitive professional education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*There are no working places at the local level in villages, settlements. In summer they’ve got an opportunity to earn, but in winter in fact they are left without any job*

(Expert, Moldova)

*After the study I went to work in my field – as a crane operator. But it happened so that I used to work two days a week, and the rest three – unpaid [leave]. I receive my salary accordingly [for two working days a week]...*

(Respondent, Belarus)

*I started to get engaged into constructions. I used to have worked in such a way for some time, and then there wasn’t any job, and I have been staying without any income for several months. I had to search for something...*

(Respondent, Ukraine)
in the Republic of Belarus the recruiters offered jobs to unemployed persons even in public employment services (they were not the workers of those organizations)

in Ukraine the recruiters used private employment agencies for person’s engaging of men into trafficking

in the Republic of Moldova there were cases when men with mental disabilities were engaged into domestic exploitation by the police officers who used their vulnerable condition

THE SOURCES FROM WHICH VOTS RECEIVED INFORMATION ABOUT THE WORK

- relatives, friends and acquaintances
- mass media, Internet websites
- ‘illegal labour markets’
- the recruiters’ work at the railway/bus stations
trafficking in men for labour exploitation
results of the study

transportation of the group of people by minibus rented by the potential employer (main)

one third of respondents purchased tickets at their own costs and were responsible for traveling to the previously agreed upon destination with the potential employer

in some cases, arrived to the agreed upon destination but had to search for their job independently, as they were not met by anyone and did not have enough money for the return ticket

WAYS OF TRANSFER:

In most of the cases, respondents crossed the border legally with an official stamp in their passport.

However, in some cases there were no marks in the passport, making it difficult for trafficking survivors to return to their country of origin.
In most cases exploitation lasted from one to three months. The longest period of exploitation was over eight years.
COUNTRIES OF DESTINATION, NUMBER OF CASES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Moldova</th>
<th>Belarus</th>
<th>Ukraine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Republic of Moldova</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Republic of Belarus</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Internally**: 4, 3, 1
- **Russian Federation**: 29, 9
- **Poland**: 1
- **Republic of Belarus**: 91
- **Ukraine**: 9, 5, 1
RESULTS OF THE STUDY

AREAS OF EXPLOITATION

54% Construction
22% Manufacture
19% Agriculture
2% Forestry
2% Gas industry
1% Setting up the Internet cables

There were a lot of workers. Local staff could go home and received salaries... Everything was legal in their cases. But in the same time we had to live in barracks and couldn’t leave the territory. We did not have any permission documents for work...

(Respondent, Ukraine)
### CONDITIONS DURING EXPLOITATION PERIOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Most of the respondents</strong></td>
<td>worked in dangerous conditions (harmful labour conditions, lack of safety means etc)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Had a huge workload</strong></td>
<td>(12-16 hour working day without any days off)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mainly lived</strong></td>
<td>at the territory of the site where they worked in unfinished premises, trailers, barracks, greenhouses, basements, garages and storage rooms (barn) etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Had limited access</strong></td>
<td>to drinking water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Had limited access</strong></td>
<td>to hot meals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Had no access</strong></td>
<td>to appropriate sanitation conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Had no access</strong></td>
<td>to adequate medical aid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*“Barracks... nothing to eat...we used to eat only tangerines... no water...“*

(Respondent, Ukraine)
TRAFFICKING IN MEN FOR LABOUR EXPLOITATION

RESULTS OF THE STUDY

EXPERIENCE OF ABUSE

**Economic**
the most widely spread form of male abuse was a lack of remuneration for labour (not paying the wage earned or only partial payments for subsistence and return ticket home) and theft of personal goods (mobile phones, tablets etc.)

**Physical**
was used in situations when men did not agree for the work conditions that were suggested or when the men violated the employers’ requirements (leaved the territory without permission or did not start the work on time etc), in cases of escape attempts

**Psychological**
was manifested via threats and intimidation

**Sexual**
the men themselves did not disclose any instances of sexual abuse, in several cases the experts indicated that they had identified signs of sexual abuse among men who requested medical aid
in most cases VoTs were released after execution of the required scope of work
also VoTs were released when permitted term for legal staying in the country without registration ended (three months in the Russian Federation)
VoTs were released when they refused to work
in some cases VoTs were released due to sudden worsening of their health
some respondents managed to escape from the place of exploitation

On their return home, some respondents attempted to locate the recruiters and to bring them to justice, but without any results; none of the respondents indicated participation in the criminal process.

Well, we have done almost everything then... they told us in the evening that we should pack up and leave, but where should we leave? We got into the car, then were travelling during twenty four hours, then we arrived, and we were told that we should go, but where should we go? Then we were told that we should turn our backs, and we got frightened that they would be shooting at us... But then they left a kind of package, started laughing, got into the car and left

(Respondent, Ukraine)
## ASSISTANCE AND REINTEGRATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Governmental organizations</th>
<th>Non-governmental organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Four respondents from Ukraine received assistance from the state social services. The main barriers for referrals to governmental organizations were:</td>
<td>All the respondents were receiving assistance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>lack of information on the types of assistance</strong></td>
<td><strong>they referred in 6-12 months on their return home</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>discrepancy of services with the real needs of victims</strong></td>
<td><strong>the main sources of the information on the assistance which they used were relatives and acquaintances who were experiencing labour exploitation along with them</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>low quality of services</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>previous negative experience relating to processing and submitting of documents</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>fear of violation of confidentiality</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*They do not disclose ... that they are victims. They feel ashamed to refer to anyone and to tell that there were such conditions... That I was kept without any food, my passport was taken away... They think: I failed this time, I would try it again, maybe, the next time it would be a success, and I will wait for a while*

(Expert, Moldova)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Received services</th>
<th>Additional necessary services</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>financial assistance (food packages, hygiene means etc)</td>
<td><strong>legal</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>education and requalification</td>
<td>- the ways of verification of employers/employment agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medical services at the IOM Rehabilitation Center for Victims of Trafficking</td>
<td>- assistance in making agreements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>programs ensured self-employment and microenterprise</td>
<td>- methods of collection of evidence base on the facts of labour exploitation)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**informational**
- placing the data on dishonest employers in the Internet/social communication networks
- informing on the organizations providing assistance to victims
- informing on risks and strategies to escape risky situations in which the exploited men can get into

**skill-building training preparing**
for high risk situations

**Received services**

**Additional necessary services**
RESULTS OF THE STUDY

RISKS OF RE-TRAFFICKING

During the interviewing period:

- most respondents were self-employed
- engaged into occasional earnings (‘moonlighting’), and that was the main source of their income
- part of the respondents already had the experience of recurring exploitation

“It’s a kind of our Russian, Belarussian ‘what if it would not happen to me’…. They are aware that they might be cheated, not paid, but there is such a despair, they go to try their fortune anyway”

(Expert, Belarus)

“I would have never ever went again any more, even if I was promised a million there, I used to be promised by them... they delivered... I do not want anything after that”

(Respondent, Ukraine)

every fifth respondent was ready to leave home again if promised employment, however to another (from previous place of exploitation) country or on the condition of official employment

“I will be more careful now…. I will go only in case any of my acquaintances went there and earned anything there”

(Respondent, Belarus)

some respondents were ready to work abroad again but only in case of emergency

only those men strongly objected the likelihood of the repeated departure who had experienced physical abuse or received traumas or chronic diseases as a result of them being exploited

“I will be more careful now…. I will go only in case any of my acquaintances went there and earned anything there”

(Respondent, Belarus)

some respondents were ready to work abroad again but only in case of emergency

only those men strongly objected the likelihood of the repeated departure who had experienced physical abuse or received traumas or chronic diseases as a result of them being exploited

“I would have never ever went again any more, even if I was promised a million there, I used to be promised by them... they delivered... I do not want anything after that”

(Respondent, Ukraine)
RESULTS OF THE STUDY ON
Trafficking in Men for Labour Exploitation
Ukraine, the Republic of Belarus, the Republic of Moldova
2016