International Organisation for Migration

Migration and transnationalism: opportunities and challenges.

Michael Keith, 9th March 2010, Geneva
Migration and transnationalism: opportunities and challenges: policy dynamics between the multicultural and the convivial

Introduction

1. Two registers of voice: rethinking the spatial and the temporal
2. *Globally*: transnational thinking, glocalisation and the transnational sense of ‘home’
3. Thinking about the dynamics of social change
4. *Nationally*: the UK Commission on Integration and Cohesion and its legacies
5. The roots of incommensurability and the pragmatics of the convivial
7. Conclusion
### Introduction: The world on the move?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Migrants (Millions)</th>
<th>World Population (Billions)</th>
<th>Migrant share of population %</th>
<th>Women % of total migrants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>47.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>47.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>47.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>49.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>49.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>49.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>49.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Estimated number of international migrants at mid year.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>World</th>
<th>Africa</th>
<th>Asia</th>
<th>Europe</th>
<th>Latin America and the Caribbean</th>
<th>Northern America</th>
<th>Oceania</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>155 518 065</td>
<td>15 972 502</td>
<td>50 875 665</td>
<td>49 400 661</td>
<td>7 130 326</td>
<td>27 773 888</td>
<td>4 365 023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>165 968 778</td>
<td>17 921 345</td>
<td>48 768 018</td>
<td>54 717 864</td>
<td>6 233 506</td>
<td>33 595 046</td>
<td>4 732 999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>178 498 563</td>
<td>17 062 143</td>
<td>51 915 384</td>
<td>57 639 114</td>
<td>6 470 622</td>
<td>40 395 432</td>
<td>5 015 868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>195 245 404</td>
<td>17 735 600</td>
<td>55 128 485</td>
<td>64 398 585</td>
<td>6 869 399</td>
<td>45 597 061</td>
<td>5 516 274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>213 943 812</td>
<td>19 263 183</td>
<td>61 323 979</td>
<td>69 819 282</td>
<td>7 480 267</td>
<td>50 042 408</td>
<td>6 014 693</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: United Nations Population Division
...... And a crisis of national identities?

- Sarkozy’s French identity debate
- Brown’s Britishness
- Jurgen Habermas and Ulrich Beck – the cosmopolitan and the European

........ A 19th century response to a 21st century problem?
1. Two registers of voice: cartographies and temporalities

Intellectual genealogies of transnationalism, integration and cohesion:

• Assimilation’s implicit teleology
• Multiculturalism’s implicit geography
• Cohesion and integration’s popularity

• Against a British model of multiculturalism? “The usefulness of the concept of multiculturalism is now beginning to be questioned, however, in part because of the way in which it encompasses such a wide spectru of difference and fails to reconcile them within a societal framework” (Ted Cantle, 2008)
Economic, social, political, cultural implications

Conventional histories, orthodox geographies

• Economic dimensions of transnationalism
  – Migrant associations and Alex Portes
  – Remittances and factor mobility:
    • FDI and exports > 20% world GDP, migrants > 3%
    • World Bank: +3% migrants 3% high income countries (13.2 million) = global real Y increase of $350 billion – exceeding global trade reform by 13%

• Political dimensions of transnationalism
  • membership and the transnational sphere
    – “It is by no means clear what it means today to speak of ‘transnational public spheres’. From the perspective of critical theory at least, the phrase sound a bit like an oxymoron”

Nancy Fraser, 2007
• Social dimensions of transnationalism
  – Family unification
  – IMO position paper- split loyalties,
  – Modernity and flows of ideas from ‘backward’ societies in ‘modern’ nations

• Cultural dimensions of transnationalism—hybridities and mobilities,
  – Ideas that flow two ways
    • 1993-99 Abacha regime and Deptford South London
    • 1971 Bangladesh independence, Muslim Brotherhood; 2010 circuits of Saudi, London, Sylhet
    • Sheikh Hasina, Awaami League, Bangla politics; and Jamaat today London and Bangladesh

• Identities and home
  – Connections - Looking beyond borders

• Policy areas and dimensions of transnationalism;
  – The family unit,
  – Political participation – and participation across borders
  – Welfare and rights: the challenges of rights across borders and the transnational
From Cantle to 7/7

**Daily Mail**

Chilling video made by London suicide bomber just before he blew himself up, and released last night by Al Qaeda, blames British Government and warns ...
Two beautiful, decent women.
One Christian. One Muslim.
Both missing with dozens more.
PRAY FOR THEM ALL
ATTACKS ON LONDON SEE PAGES 2 TO 13
POLICE APPEAL FOR ASSISTANCE

BRIXTON BOMB

Do you recognise this man?

Police are keen to identify this man in connection with their enquiries into the Brixton Bomb.

He is described as white, aged in his late teens/early twenties, approximately 5’6” - 5’9” with a slim build.

On Saturday, 17th April, 1999, he was wearing a white baseball cap and a dark zip up jacket and was seen in the Brixton area.

If you think you know this man call the freephone, Anti-Terrorist Hotline or

Tel. 0800 789 321

There is a substantial reward for information which leads to the arrest and conviction for those responsible for this attack.
The Commission on Integration and Cohesion’s uncertain genealogy

• Tony Blair and the bombs: but what did the bombing mean?
• Charles Clarke (HO) and the place of faith
• John Reid (HO) and terror
• Ruth Kelly (DCLG) and Britishness
• Hazel Blears (DCLG) and community power
2. Transnational thinking, glocalisation and a 21st century sense of ‘home’

- Identification and belonging
- The importance of geographical scale
- Technological change
- Historical amnesia
- Precarious social life
- The policy implications of ‘home’ thinking
3. Thinking about the dynamics of social change: rethinking ‘home’

Zygmunt Bauman

• “The new migration casts a question mark upon the bond between identity and citizenship, individual and place, neighbourhood and belonging”

• *Culture in a globalised city* (July 2008)
3. Thinking about the dynamics of social change: the creativity of modern (migrant) life

- Thinking differently about home
- The tensions between languages of belonging (identity, sentiment, imaginary communities) and languages of citizenship (rationality, rights, justice)
- The ethical (normative) and the descriptive (empirical)
- And the policy dilemmas of scale (both up and down - continental, national, urban, neighbourhood)
- And the policy dilemmas of temporality
- The scales and times of home making for ‘the transnational’
Migrant settlement: Fietas, Soweto, downtown Joburg
Again and again I love the city
Christiania, Copenhagen: ossified appropriation
International skilled labour and London’s machine for living
Chengzhongcun 'villages in the city’ migrant ‘handshake apartments’
- woshou fang 握手房
civillagety
The point here is to highlight the creativities of the attempts to make a home; the embossed realities of systemic injustices in the bricks and mortar of the process of settlement and the manner in which the political is realised in ways major and minor through the coming into being of new forms and accommodations of migrant (bare) life.
Zygmunt Bauman

• “The new migration casts a question mark upon the bond between identity and citizenship, individual and place, neighbourhood and belonging”

• *Culture in a globalised city* (July 2008)

• How do the transnational dynamics of ‘home making’ reconfigure the relationship between identity and belonging on the one hand and citizenship and rights on the other? (at different geographical scales and at times of rapid social change)
4. The Commission on Integration and Cohesion and its legacies
The Commission was tasked with:

– Examining the issues that raise tensions between different groups in different areas, and that lead to segregation and conflict;

– Suggesting how local community and political leadership can push further against perceived barriers to cohesion and integration;

– Looking at how local communities themselves can be empowered to tackle extremist ideologies;

– Developing approaches that build local areas’ own capacity to prevent problems, and ensure they have the structures in place to recover from periods of tension
The nature of diversity is changing
Migration to the UK has been increasing.

Total International Migration (TIM) to/from the UK 1991-2004

source ONS website
This may be why the public are very concerned about “Race relations / immigration / immigrants” - in 2006- and 2007 it was in MORI polls “the top issue currently facing Britain”

- MORI poll May 2006 – “race relations/immigration/immigrants” was the most commonly named main issue facing Britain today, named by 19% of people. As the graph below shows concern has been rising since 1997 – and this was the first time it had overtaken crime
Some evidence diversity does not correlate with lack of conviviality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% of BME households in area (deciles)</th>
<th>Agreed that people from different backgrounds got on well together (%)</th>
<th>Agreed that residents respect ethnic difference between people (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 (lowest density)</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 (highest density)</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Parallel lives” and the UK “sleepwalking into segregation”?

Ted Cantle “Whilst the physical segregation of housing estates and inner city areas came as no surprise, the team was particularly struck by the depth of polarisation of our towns and cities. The extent to which these physical divisions were compounded by so many other aspects of our daily lives, was very evident. Separate educational arrangements, community and voluntary bodies, employment, places of worship, language, social and cultural networks, means that many communities operate on the basis of a series of parallel lives. These lives often do not seem to touch at any point, let alone overlap and promote any meaningful interchanges. There is little wonder that the ignorance about each others’ communities can easily grow into fear; especially where this is exploited by extremist groups determined to undermine community harmony and foster divisions.”

Source: Building Cohesive Communities (Home Office 2001)

Trevor Phillips: “We are a society which, almost without noticing it, is becoming more divided by race and religion. …If we allow this to continue, we could end up …. living in a New Orleans-style Britain of passively co-existing ethnic and religious communities, eyeing each other uneasily over the fences of our differences…. we are sleepwalking our way to segregation. We are becoming strangers to each other, and we are leaving communities to be marooned outside the mainstream.”

Source speech of 22/09/05 from CRE website
Two chimera

• Segregation - and the Phillips debates

• Multiculturalism debates – ‘the beginning’, the ‘end’ and the middle of multiculturalism
Fundamental principles

1. **Shared futures**; a sense of becoming over being; shared identifies looking forward that recognise diverse histories and identities looking backwards

2. A notion of **citizenship** that is fit for purpose for the 21st century and that accommodates different geographical scales of local, regional, national and transnational rights and responsibilities

3. An **ethics of hospitality** that recognises the value of the stranger and the newcomer within a framework of mutuality and civility

4. A sense of **visible social justice** that appeals not only to equality of opportunity and outcome but also to transparency of the decision making process
5. The roots of incommensurability and the pragmatics of the convivial
The analytical incommensurabilities of the languages of rights and languages of belonging

- Rights and the good life: jumping geographical scales of citizenship
- A communitarian sense of belonging; place and the politics of identity
- The rationing of finite resources; mapping, territorialising and deterritorialising
- Made more complex by plural temporalities and spatialities
  - Local membership and school places *de facto* local citizenship
  - Transnational associations and democratic politics
  - Welfare benefits and rationing – e.g. housing
6. Translating Sonali Gardens: policy opportunities and challenges of the transnational
Sonali Gardens thematics: A complex assemblage of rights and belongings

- The transnational and challenges to unitary citizenship
- Ethnicity vs. faith; secularism and Islam
- The politics of recognition, identity and the finite logics of the identitarian
- Eligibility criteria; welfare reform, social services, Weber’s paradox
- Land and property rights: the land deal, public ownership, private ownership: property as a bundle of rights
- Voice and choice – social policy reform and modernisation language
- Community power – networks and Sonali gardens as a vote bank. Balagonj, Bianibazar (Kalaziri)
- The state, governance and hybrid institutional forms
- Estate transfer and public debt
Conclusion: transnationalism and migration

- Social constructions of times and spaces of transnationalism where (revisiting Simmel) “distance means that he who is close by is far, and strangeness means that he who also is far is actually near”

- Transnational dilemmas. Questioning our ability to know and our ability to govern: Simmel’s edit – social change and policy dilemmas of social engineering

- Transnational opportunities. In the register of policy; from chaotic conceptualisation to pragmatic intervention: the discursive nature of ‘conviviality’ and the cosmopolitan: rationing

- In the scholarly register: the dynamics of social change: temporalities, cartographies and creativities of the multicultural present: planning the changing society